

**Proceedings of the 48<sup>th</sup> Technical Committee meeting of Karnataka Evaluation Authority held in Planning Dept. Meeting Hall, M.S. Building, Dr. B.R. Ambedkar Veedhi, Bengaluru on 08<sup>th</sup> September 2020 at 11:00 AM**

The Additional Chief Evaluation Officer, KEA and Member of Technical Committee welcomed the Chairperson, and members of the Technical Committee.

The Agenda items that were discussed and decisions taken thereon are as follows:

**Terms of Reference for the evaluation studies were discussed and the following revisions were to be incorporated within one week: -**

Sl. No.	Agenda Item	Changes proposed in ToR
1	Evaluation of Jungle Lodges and Resorts from 2014-15 to 2018-19  <b>Tourism Department</b>	<p>Evaluation Scope and objectives to be revised with more specificity and focus on achieving the stated objectives of the organization.</p> <p>Financial analysis parameters to be revised as suggested by the Department.</p> <p>Utilization of on-line sales promotion platform.</p> <p>Occupancy rates to be estimated as per scheduled holidays, seasons for 200 days. Suggestions for alternative promotional and Competitive packages for different categories of tourists to increase the Occupancy Rate.</p> <p>Context variables -demand Supply analysis- location analysis-historical - to be included in the operational analysis.</p> <p>Valuation of services- method to include Social- commercial and environmental services.</p> <p>Analysis of reviews and suggestion book and Customer satisfaction Index.</p> <p>Comparative analysis with other States like Madhya Pradesh, Assam.</p> <p>Best practices, case studies to be included.</p> <p><b>Revised ToR to be circulated among members for approval by 15.9.2020</b></p>
2	Environmental Problems and Congestion in Bengaluru- Evolving Sustainable Solutions.  <b>Urban Development Department</b>	<p>ToR to be revised based on following suggestions.</p> <p>Evaluation Scope and objectives to be revised and refined with more focus on environment and traffic congestion solutions apart from</p>

		<p>updating recommendations from earlier studies.</p> <p>Study to be based on secondary data analysis.</p> <p>Issues to be included</p> <p>Improving the future urban planning to avoid congestion through corrective measures, decentralization of services, better governance frameworks, review of Bengaluru Urban Development planning and Policy.</p> <p>Integrated Satellite townships feasibility – Telangana model- shifting of activities through incentives &amp; packages in PPP mode.</p> <p>Developing new transport systems. -e-mobility- other feasible solutions. Increasing revenue &amp; efficiency – Output and input specific efficiency-exploring viable and sustainable solutions.</p> <p>To be taken up as a research Study</p> <p><b>ToR to be revised and submitted for approval by circulation by 15.09.2020.</b></p>
3	<p>Evaluation of Karnataka State Road Transport Corporation (KSRTC, NWKRTC and NEKRTC) from 2014-15 to 2019-20</p> <p><b>Department of Public Enterprises</b></p>	<p>ToR to be revised based on following suggestions.</p> <p>Evaluation Scope and objectives to be revised with more specificity and focus on stated objectives of the organization.</p> <p>Exploring new transport systems as options for increasing revenue and reducing pollution (e-mobility).</p> <p>Reviewing policy hurdles in flexibility of operations.</p> <p><b>Impact of different phases of Covid-19</b></p> <p>Comparative Analysis of all the Corporations and factors contributing to success/ failure.</p> <p><b>Add to methodology the following</b></p> <p>Estimation of Customer Satisfaction Index and Financial Sustainability Index</p> <p>Estimation of output input specific efficiencies.</p> <p>Sampling to be representative and cover different modes of transport.</p> <p><b>ToR to be revised and submitted for approval by circulation by 15.9.2020.</b></p>

<p>4</p>	<p>Evaluation of Karnataka Rural Infrastructure Development Ltd from 2014-15 to 2018-19.</p> <p><b>Rural Development and Panchayat Raj Department</b></p>	<p>ToR to be revised based on following suggestions.</p> <p>Evaluation Scope and objectives to be revised with more clarity and focus, on the stated objectives to enhance rural employment opportunities and prevention of middlemen.</p> <p>Classification of works into different grades for sampling.</p> <p>KRIDL Vs Private construction companies- cost effectiveness and comparative advantage.</p> <p>Gender &amp; SCP/TSP dimensions to be added in the analysis.</p> <p>Employment Generation through the KRIDL works and community projects of Gram panchayats.</p> <p>Quality check and Monitoring mechanism.</p> <p>Adherence to Timeline for completion of works.</p> <p>Revise the FGD component-</p> <p><b>Impact Evaluation -develop specific indicators for assessment of impact</b></p> <p>Hostels- impact on education parameters.</p> <p>Works under Suvarna Gram Yojane and Gram Vikas Yojane- impact on Community- health education Livelihood, accessibility</p> <p>Percentage Growth in Local Employment generated across the works undertaken</p> <p><b>Activities taken under CSR</b></p> <p><b>Impact of Covid-19 on work</b></p> <p>Revise the sample for proper representation of the Departmental works.</p> <p>Models in other States to be reviewed</p> <p><b>ToR to be revised and submitted for approval by circulation by 15.9.2020</b></p>
----------	---	--

5	<p>Evaluation of Interest Subsidy for Women Entrepreneurs implemented by Women Development Corporation from 2015-16 to 2018-19.</p> <p><b>Karnataka State Finance Corporation Karnataka State Women Development Corporation</b></p> <p>Evaluation Scope and objectives to be revised with more clarity and focus on the relevance of this intervention vis a vis other similar scheme.</p> <p>Preliminary secondary data analysis to identify core issues and incorporate them in the objectives of evaluation</p> <p>The scheme of Interest subsidy started in 2007 and for women entrepreneurs in 2015. The evaluation should consider both schemes for the period of 2015-16 to 2018. Accordingly, terms of reference to be altered.</p> <p>Evaluation Objectives to focus on</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To identify factors- socio, economical, technical/training that has contributed to the performance/non-performance of women entrepreneurs</li> <li>• To review the performance/non-performance of women entrepreneurs to the selection process of the beneficiary</li> <li>• To examine the marketing strategies adopted by the women entrepreneurs and suggest possible gaps/change of strategies for marketing.</li> <li>• To examine the economic viability of the enterprises.</li> <li>• Impact of the scheme on the labour force participation rate.</li> </ul> <p>Review the sampling, make it stratified with two top performing districts across the divisions and Yadgir as low performing district.</p> <p>The KPIs to be identified -social, economic, technical/training to measure performance across the categories of women. SCP/ TSP component to be included in evaluation.</p> <p>In methodology, add Statistical measures- Correlation, Women Empowerment Index etc.</p> <p>Add Case studies/ Success stories.</p> <p>Study Team</p> <p>Ph.D/ PG in Economics/ Social Work/ Women's Studies/ Commerce and Management/</p>
---	---

		<p>In the Study Team one core Team member with PG in Women's Studies.</p> <p><b>ToR to be revised and submitted for approval by circulation by 15.9.2020</b></p>
6	<p>Evaluation of Impact of NMSA – Rainfed Area Development Program from 2014-15 to 2018-19</p> <p><b>Watershed Development Department</b></p>	<p>Evaluation objectives to be revised with more clarity and focus on improvement in yield and income of farmers.</p> <p>The Evaluation Issues and KPIs to be related directly to the objectives of the Programme as related to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maximization of farm returns.</li> <li>• Increasing agricultural productivity</li> <li>• To minimize the adverse impact of possible crop failure</li> <li>• Enhancement of farmer's income and livelihood support for reduction of poverty in rainfed areas</li> <li>• Increase in Employment and</li> <li>• Reduction in migration</li> <li>• Increase in marketable surplus</li> </ul> <p>Revise the sampling methodology and sample size. Sample to be drawn mainly from rainfed areas focusing on North Karnataka and activities that are covered under the scheme. Sample to include SC/ST/women beneficiaries.</p> <p>Suggest some statistical measures such as: Crop diversity index, livelihood index, productivity index for measurement of the impact.</p> <p><b>ToR to be revised and submitted for approval by circulation by 15.9.2020</b></p>
7	<p>Evaluation of Karnataka State Forest Development Corporation Karnataka Forest Industries Corporation Ltd and Karnataka Cashew Development Corporation from 2014-15 to -2019-20.</p> <p><b>Karnataka Forest Department</b></p>	<p>Evaluation objectives to be revised with more clarity and focus on integration of different corporations to enhance production and productivity.</p> <p>Objectives to include</p> <p>Issues related to merger of Corporations.</p> <p>Competitiveness and Productivity.</p> <p>Utilization of Barren land for increasing the forest cover.</p> <p>Maximization of economic returns &amp; supply chain of forest produce and marketing.</p> <p>Synergy with Agriculture, Horticulture Departments and other Corporations.</p>

		<p>Specify the issues as related to the functions of these corporations and the KPIs to be related to these specific areas of the corporation.</p> <p>In Cashew Corporation, the impact of model cashew plantations and R&amp;D activities on productivity &amp; output- post-harvest processing</p> <p>Arrange the evaluation issues in three different sections for specificity and clarity.</p> <p>KPIs to be identified based on the objectives and activities of the Corporations.</p> <p>Sampling methodology, Sample size to be revised based on additional information from the Dept.</p> <p>FGD sample to be revised</p> <p><b>ToR to be revised and submitted for approval by circulation by 15.9.2020.</b></p>
8	<p>Evaluation of functioning of Multi village Water Supply Schemes in Karnataka from 2001-02 to 2018-19</p> <p><b>Rural Drinking Water and Sanitation Department</b></p>	<p>Evaluation period to be revised restricting to last five years 2015-2020.</p> <p>Evaluation objectives to be revised with more clarity and focus on the SDG indicators and targets to fill the demand-supply gap.</p> <p>Objectives to include Budgetary allocations, Synergy with Urban drinking water and Water Resources Departments to cover the villages with no surface water sources in a fixed time frame.</p> <p>Result based monitoring of the scheme.</p> <p>Functioning of Similar schemes in other states</p> <p>Refine KPIs as related to SDG-3 and SDG-6</p> <p>Decrease in incidence of waterborne diseases</p> <p>Decrease in deaths</p> <p>Decrease in IMR and CMR</p> <p>Improvement in Health Index</p> <p>Access to potable water-% of HH</p> <p>Frequency, Regularity and adequacy as per norms</p> <p>Functionality</p> <p>Water quality</p> <p>Norms fulfilled</p> <p>Issues- Include villages with water quality problems, Gender issues.</p>

	<p>Sample Size- Give break up District wise and number of schemes to be covered &amp; habitations</p> <p>Case Studies- Success and failure cases</p> <p>Revise Study team</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Ph.D /PG in Economics/ Management /Public Policy as PI</li><li>2. One Civil Engineer/ Public Health Engineering</li><li>3. One Geologist</li><li>4. Statistician, Data Analyst</li></ol> <p><b>ToR to be revised and submitted for approval by circulation by 15.9.2020</b></p>
--	--

The committee was highly dissatisfied with the quality of ToRs. There was lack of preparation, data collection and analysis or review of existing scenario while formulating the ToRs. The departments were requested to immediately share the required primary or secondary data to make the ToRs for evaluation more meaningful.

Meeting concluded with vote of thanks.

  
(Sudarshan G A, IFS)

Member Secretary of Technical Committee of  
KEA and Chief Evaluation Officer  
Karnataka Evaluation Authority



(Dr. Shalini Rajneesh, IAS)  
Chairperson of the Technical  
Committee of KEA  
Additional Chief Secretary to Govt.,  
Planning, Programme Monitoring  
Statistics Department

